

ENVIRONMENTAL SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

14 JUNE 2016

Present: County Councillor Mitchell(Chairperson)
County Councillors Clark, Hill-John, Lomax and Darren Williams

1 : APPOINTMENT OF CHAIRPERSON

The Committee noted that the Annual Council on 26 May 2016 appointed Councillor Mitchell as Chairperson of the Committee.

2 : TERMS OF REFERENCE

The Committee noted that Annual Council on 26 May 2016 approved the following Terms of Reference:

- To scrutinise, measure and actively promote improvement in the Council's performance in the provision of services and compliance with Council policies, aims and objectives in the area of environmental sustainability, including:
 - Strategic Planning Policy
 - Sustainability Policy
 - Environmental Health Policy
 - Public Protection Policy
 - Licensing Policy
 - Waste Management
 - Strategic Waste Projects
 - Street Cleansing
 - Cycling and Walking
 - Streetscape
 - Strategic Transportation Partnership
 - Transport Policy and Development
 - Intelligent Transport Solutions
 - Public Transport
 - Parking Management
- To assess the impact of partnerships with and resources and services provided by external organisations including the Welsh Government, joint local government services, Welsh Government Sponsored Public Bodies and quasi-departmental non-governmental bodies on the effectiveness of Council service delivery.
- To report to an appropriate Cabinet or Council meeting on its findings and to make recommendations on measures which may enhance Council performance and service delivery in this area.

3 : COMMITTEE MEMBERSHIP

The Committee noted that Annual Council on 26 May 2016 appointed the following Members to the Committee:

Councillors Aubrey, Clark, Chris Davis, Hill-John, Lomax, White and Darren Williams

4 : APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

Apologies for absence were received from Councillor White.

5 : DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

No declarations of interest were received.

6 : CARDIFF'S TRANSPORT STRATEGY

The Committee received a briefing report setting out the approach taken by the Authority to develop Cardiff's new Transport Strategy prior to the Strategy being considered by the Cabinet at their meeting on 14 July 2016. The briefing included an outline of the purpose of the Strategy and the proposals it contains; receive an explanation of the rationale and supporting evidence for particular transport interventions; opportunities to discuss technical matters and issues with Council policy; opportunities to discuss public consultation; opportunities to discuss ways of raising and maintaining public awareness/interest in the Strategy.

Members were advised that Cardiff Local Development Plan (LDP), which was approved in January 2016, highlighted the need for a shift to sustainable transport to support the future growth of the City. The LDP set a target of 50% of all journeys to be made by sustainable modes of travel. The Transport Strategy provided a summary of the Council's transport priorities and proposed transport projects which will help achieve the 50% sustainable travel target by 2026.

The LDP provided for 41,000 new homes and 40,000 new jobs by 2026. It was estimated that this would result in a 32% increase in road traffic and intensify pressure on the City's road network. In order to accommodate growth on this scale the overall share of daily journeys made by car must decrease and a greater proportion of journeys need to be made by walking, cycling and public transport. To enable such a shift policies in the LDP seek to secure significant improvements to public transport and travel networks. Furthermore, it is the Council's ambition for Cardiff to become Europe's 'Most Liveable Capital City'. Integrating new developments with the provision of sustainable transport infrastructure is one of the key enablers to achieving the Council's ambitions.

Cardiff is the economic driver for the wider Capital City Region which has a population of approximately 1.4 million people. Cardiff itself provide one third of the region's employment. Within this region people make approximately 1.5 million trips every day with many journeys coming from neighbouring local authorities. These journeys exert considerable pressure on Cardiff transport network. The development of the Cardiff Capital Region Metro project will form one part of the central elements of the £1.2 billion package of investment secured through the Cardiff Capital Region City Deal. The Metro will provide the connectivity needed to support growth and support the delivery of sustainable transport.

It was considered that following the approval of the LDP and due to the central role that transport should play within the City Deal initiative, that the Council's transport vision and priorities would need to be captured within a single Strategy. The Strategy

is intended to provide a complete overview of plans to improve Cardiff's transport system and to explain why the projects proposed are needed to support the future growth of the City and the wider City Region. The Strategy aims to provide the principle reference for future communications and public engagement on transportation matters.

It is anticipated that the Transport Strategy will outline the following:

- The main transport issues and challenges which the Council and its partners are working to address;
- How improvements to Cardiff's transport system are needed to support the development of new sustainable communities envisaged within the Local Development Plan;
- The Council's priorities for individual modes of travel and key proposals for improving the transport system.

The Chairperson welcomed Councillor Ramesh Patel, Cabinet Member for Transport, Planning and Sustainability, Andrew Gregory, Corporate Director and Matt Price, Transport Vision, Policy and Strategy. The officers were invited to deliver a brief [presentation](#) on the Cardiff Transport Strategy.

The Chairperson invited Members of the Committee to raise questions, comment or seek clarification on the information received. Those discussions are summarised as follows:

- Members of the Committee considered they the Transport Strategy would impact on the Tourism Strategy. Members asked what consultation or communication has taken place with tourism stakeholders. The Cabinet Member gave an undertaking to include tourism stakeholders in the consultation process.
- Members asked whether the Capital Region Metro project included any proposals to connect Radyr and Coryton Stations and, by doing so, complete a circular rail network in the City. Officers stated that a decision on the mode of transport for the Capital Region Metro has not yet been made. This decision was the responsibility of the Welsh Government. The Cabinet Member accepted that the completion of a circular line was a logical step and he agreed with the basic principle. However, there has been no dialogue regarding this and it would be one of a range of proposals to be discussed.
- Officers advised that a decision on the mode of transport was expected late in 2016. Discussions would then take place regarding the detailed designs. It was anticipated that this process would take some time.
- The Cabinet Member asked the Committee to note that the transportation corridors were mapped and set out in the LDP. The Metro project was a bonus but was in the hands of the Welsh Government.
- Members asked what protections were in place in terms of alignments. Officers, again, stated that the discussion held did not address that level of

detail. Officers acknowledged that there were concerns regarding alignment of routes. Once the method or mode of transport was known it would be possible to move forward with these issues.

- The Committee asked whether the principle of a compensatory scheme has been considered. The Cabinet Member urged caution as these matters are not the responsibility of the local authority. Officers advised that an implementation body will be established to deliver the Metro. It will be for that body to address such issues. It was anticipated that an objective value added assessment of individual routes would be used to inform broader discussions. The impact on local communities will be addressed, aspects of which can be taken forward as part of the Transport Strategy.
- The Cabinet Member confirmed that there has been no decision regarding station allocation. Again, these matters were tied to the decision on transport mode. Heavy rail presented limited opportunities for new stations. However, light rail could lead to the creation of 5 or 6 new stations.
- The Committee asked at what stage efforts to address 'pinch points' on the highway network were and what was being done to improve bus routes. Officers stated that the Transport Strategy addresses these issues and the solutions. Discussions are ongoing with developers re the use of S106 funding for bus/cycle/walking routes. The Cabinet Member indicated that the authority was aware where the pinch points are and measures will be taken in conjunction with development proposals. As part of the planning application process there is an assessment of the impact of planning application on transport. As a result, measures to facilitate sustainable movement will be proposed. It was also important to get the master planning of major applications right so that those developments contain schools and other facilities in order that the number of journeys can be reduced.
- Members of the noted that developers are providing free bus passes to customers purchasing houses. Members suggested that where free bus travel is being provided a bus service should be established before residents locate there. The Cabinet Member agreed and stated that it was possible to use contributions from developers to subsidise bus services and help to embed sustainable travel behaviour.
- Members asked what a bus corridor on Cathedral Road might look. Officer advised that they would work closely with local Ward Members to get the maximum benefit from a bus corridor whilst minimising the impact on local residents. There were some locations of Cathedral Road where queues of traffic form. It was anticipated that these locations would benefit from bus lanes. It was not suggested that bus lanes would be installed on the whole length of road. The Cabinet Member stated that commuters used Cathedral Road for parking. They would be encouraged to use public transport in the future.
- Officers confirmed that, according to projections, the move towards the stated aim of a 50:50 modal transport split was on target. The Ask Cardiff Survey has demonstrated 57:43. It was anticipated that a light rail system (Cardiff Metro) would provide an additional 5-10% switch. Members asked whether the Ask

Cardiff figure related to commuter journeys or all journeys. Officers agreed to provide the Committee with clarification of the information provided.

- Referring to future transportation priorities, the Committee asked what criteria would be used when considering more or new stations. Officers stated that passenger demand, technical feasibility and cost would be considered. However, if the Welsh Government decides that heavy rail is their preferred option, then new stations were unlikely. Light rail would not require signalling, more train could be run and stations can be closer together. Light rail would provide considerably more opportunities.
- Officers confirmed that commuting (trips to work) by cycling has increased from 4% in 2003 to between 8-9%. A number of new initiatives would aim to improve these figures further, including a new cycle hire scheme and the central transport interchange.
- Responding to a question from a Member of the Committee, the Cabinet Member stated that enforcement of the 20mph zones was the responsibility of South Wales Police. The Cabinet Member advised that the authority was currently having dialogue with South Wales Police and the Cabinet Member also intends to clearly put this point to the Police Commission when they meet.
- Member raised concerns regarding the condition of road surfaces in the City. Members considered that if we are to encourage people to cycle more the road surface needs to be safe enough for them to do so. The Cabinet Member stated that extra provision had been set aside in the budget to make permanent repairs to road surfaces. The authority needs to be informed of potholes when they occur.

AGREED – That the Chairperson writes on the Committee's behalf to the Cabinet Member to convey their comments and observations.

7 : STREET LIGHTING - MEMBER BRIEFING

The Committee received a briefing report regarding recent proposals on street lighting in Cardiff. The report focussed on the procurement of a contract to deliver LED street lighting and an update on the street dimming contract.

Members were advised that a key theme of Cardiff's aspirations to become the most liveable European Capital City is the enhancing of the environment and the reduction of Cardiff's carbon footprint within the context of budgetary control. The proposed conversion of 13,608 street lights located on strategic highways to LED was hoped to contribute to the Council's liveable city aspirations. Furthermore, the Well-Being of Future Generations Act 2015 requires the Council to contribute to seven national Well-Being goals, including the 'Prosperous Wales' goal of promoting a low carbon society; and to climate change mitigation actions in both the 'Long Term' and 'Preventative' Ways of Working set out in the act.

The report summarised the positive impacts of LED lighting in terms of carbon reduction and budgetary savings. Street lighting accounts for 25% of the authority's total carbon footprint. The proposals switch to LED on strategic routes would result in an estimated 3,476 tonnes of CO₂ being removed from the Council's operations,

equivalent to a £63k Carbon Reduction Commitment saving. There would also be a reduction in energy cost of £791k per annum, assuming costs remain at current levels, and taking into account installation costs, maintenance costs and financing of the project.

Members were advised that a trial of different LED lanterns had been completed and the specification of the procurement exercise was defined so as to meet the best results of the trial. The exercise identified that by using 3,000 Kelvin LED lights the light provided would match the light from the streetwise lanterns replaced as part of the dimming contract. This would provide a uniformed light colour and temperature across the City.

As part of the LED street lighting project it was also proposed that a CMS management system is implemented on the strategic road network. A CMS will allow faults to be reported automatically and for officers to raise lighting levels on occasions, for example, in the event of an incident.

The report provided Members of the Committee with an overview of the procurement process, including a potential procurement timeline. The report also provided details of the experiences of the other local authorities in Wales who have introduced LED lighting in recent years.

Members were advised that the final decision must have regard to an Equalities Impact Assessment (EQA). An EQA for the proposed scheme was carried out, the results of which were appended the report at Appendix 2.

The Chairperson welcomed Gary Brown, Operational Manager, Assets Engineering and Operations. Gary Brown was invited to deliver a brief [presentation](#) on the LED street light project.

The Chairperson invited Members of the Committee to raise questions, comment or seek clarification on the information received. Those discussions are summarised as follows:

- Members were advised that feedback from residents in other local authorities suggested that LED lights operating at 5000 to 7000 Kelvins were too bright and intrusive. Cardiff's LED lights would operate at 3000 Kelvins, thus providing additional savings.
- Officers confirmed that there were street lighting assets in the City which were not on adopted highways and were, therefore, the responsibility of directorates. Directorates were unable to provide any data on the number/location of these assets. Officers suggested that a 'One Council' approach to the management of these assets will require that a full audit is carried out, as any future Invest to Save projects are going to require good data. Officers were currently working with Directorates to move this issue forward.
- LED lighting is more reliable and fewer faults would be expected.
- Officers agreed to provide the Committee with the costs of providing street lighting on strategic routes currently.

- There was some discussion around the overall value of the financial benefits that the LED contract would provide. Members asked for a detailed breakdown of all costs and savings projected by the scheme.

AGREED – That the Chairperson writes on the Committee’s behalf to the Cabinet Member to convey their comments and observations.

8 : WORK PROGRAMME

The Committee discussed options for developing and agreeing the Committee’s Work Programme for 2016/17. The Principal Scrutiny Officer suggested that a list of potential work programme items be evaluated with items being scored in order of preference using a scoring matrix.

AGREED – That the draft work programme be presented at the Committee meeting on 12 July 2016.

9 : DATE OF NEXT MEETING

Members were advised that the next Environment Scrutiny Committee is scheduled for 12 July 2016.

The meeting terminated at 7.15 pm